



Comparing the effectiveness of cognitive behavioral therapy and therapy based on acceptance and commitment on depression and negative emotions in divorced women

Ariana. Shabannezhad¹

1 M.A, Department of Clinical Psychology, Sari Branch, Islamic Azad University, Sari, Iran

Email: arianashabannezhad888@gmail.com Received: 25.07.2022 Acceptance: 05.01.2023

Journal of
Applied Family Therapy

eISSN: 2717-2430
http://Aftj.ir

Vol. 3, No. 5, Pp: 631-645
Winter 2023 Special Issue

Original research article

How to Cite This Article:

Shabannezhad, A. (2023). Comparing the effectiveness of cognitive behavioral therapy and therapy based on acceptance and commitment on depression and negative emotions in divorced women. *Aftj*, 3(5): 631-645.



© 2023 by the authors. Licensee Iranian Association of Women's Studies, Tehran, Iran. This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International (CC BY-NC 4.0 license) (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>)

Abstract

Aim: Divorced women are more exposed to mental, social and physical injuries such as anxiety, depression, suicide, heart diseases, etc. than married women. The purpose of this study was to compare the effectiveness of cognitive behavioral therapy and therapy based on acceptance and commitment on depression and negative emotions in divorced women in Sari city. **Method:** The purpose of the present research was applied and its method was quasi-experimental with a pre-test and post-test design with two experimental groups and a control group and a two-month follow-up period. The statistical population of the research included all divorced women who referred to a private counseling center in Sari city in 2023, 30 people were selected by available sampling and randomly assigned to two experimental groups and one control group. Also, in order to collect information from the dimension of negative affect, the scale of positive and negative affect by Tellgen and Watson (1985) and the second edition of Beck's depression questionnaire (1996) were used. SPSS-26 software and three-stage repeated measures analysis of variance and Bonferroni post hoc test were used for statistical analysis of data. **Results:** Cognitive behavioral therapy and therapy based on acceptance and commitment had a significant effect on depression scores (F=4.50 and F=4.81) and negative emotion (F=6.14 and F=6.07) over time. ($p>0.01$). Also, no significant difference was observed between the post-test and follow-up scores ($p<0.05$). Therefore, it can be concluded that these effects had good stability. Analysis using the Bonferroni test shows that the difference between the effectiveness of the two trainings on variables is not significant ($p<0.05$). **Conclusion:** Based on the available findings, it can be concluded that to reduce depression and negative emotions in divorced women, both methods of cognitive behavioral therapy and therapy based on acceptance and commitment can be used, and there is no significant difference between the effectiveness of these treatment methods.

Keywords: cognitive behavioral therapy, therapy based on acceptance and commitment, negative affect, depression, women, divorce.

References

- Apolinário-Hagen, J., Drüge, M., & Fritsche, L. (2020). Cognitive behavioral therapy, mindfulness-based cognitive therapy and acceptance commitment therapy for anxiety disorders: integrating traditional with digital treatment approaches. *Anxiety disorders*, 291-329.
- Asadi, M., Ghasemzadeh, N., Nazarifar, M., & Sarvandani, M. N. (2020). The effectiveness of emotion-focused couple therapy on marital satisfaction and positive feelings towards the spouse. *International Journal of Health Studies*, 6(4), 36-40.
- Bai, Z., Luo, S., Zhang, L., Wu, S., & Chi, I. (2020). Acceptance and commitment therapy (ACT) to reduce depression: A systematic review and meta-analysis. *Journal of affective disorders*, 260, 728-737.
- Beck, A. T., Rush A. J., Shaw, B., & Emery, G. (1979). *Cognitive therapy of depression*. New York: Guilford Press.
- Beck, A. T., Steer, R. A., & Brown, G. K. (1996). *BDI–II, Beck Depression Inventory: Manual*. 2. Boston: Harcourt Brace.
- Beck, J. S. (2020). *Cognitive behavior therapy: Basics and beyond*. Guilford Publications.
- Boschloo, L., Bekhuis, E., Weitz, E. S., Reijnders, M., DeRubeis, R. J., Dimidjian, S., ... & Cuijpers, P. (2019). The symptom-specific efficacy of antidepressant medication vs. cognitive behavioral therapy in the treatment of depression: Results from an individual patient data meta-analysis. *World Psychiatry*, 18(2), 183-191.
- Chen, K. H., Brown, C. L., Wells, J. L., Rothwell, E. S., Otero, M. C., Levenson, R. W., & Fredrickson, B. L. (2021). Physiological linkage during shared positive and shared negative emotion. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 121(5), 1029.
- Coto-Lesmes, R., Fernández-Rodríguez, C., & González-Fernández, S. (2020). Acceptance and Commitment Therapy in group format for anxiety and depression. A systematic review. *Journal of affective disorders*, 263, 107-120.
- Darbani, S. A., & Parsakia, K. (2022). The effectiveness of strength-based counseling on the reduction of divorced women's depression. *Journal of Assessment and Research in Applied Counseling*, 4(2), 28-32.
- Dobkin, R. D., Mann, S. L., Gara, M. A., Interian, A., Rodriguez, K. M., & Menza, M. (2020). Telephone-based cognitive behavioral therapy for depression in Parkinson disease: A randomized controlled trial. *Neurology*, 94(16), e1764-e1773.
- Gautam, M., Tripathi, A., Deshmukh, D., & Gaur, M. (2020). Cognitive behavioral therapy for depression. *Indian journal of psychiatry*, 62(Suppl 2), S223.
- Ghahramani, M., Khalatbari, J., & Taghvaei, D. (2022). Comparing the effectiveness of cognitive-behavioral therapy and treatment focused on compassion therapy on the resilience of women on the verge of divorce. *Journal of Applied Family Therapy*, 3(3), 474-488.
- Ghorbani Amir, H. A., Moradi, O., Arefi, M., & Hamzeh, A. (2022). The Effectiveness of Cognitive behavior therapy and Acceptance and Commitment therapy (ACT) on Self-Control and Resiliency in Divorced Women. *Journal of Applied Family*

Therapy, 3(4), 493-508.

- Gloster, A. T., Walder, N., Levin, M. E., Twohig, M. P., & Karekla, M. (2020). The empirical status of acceptance and commitment therapy: A review of meta-analyses. *Journal of Contextual Behavioral Science, 18*, 181-192.
- González-Valero, G., Zurita-Ortega, F., Ubago-Jiménez, J. L., & Puertas-Molero, P. (2019). Use of meditation and cognitive behavioral therapies for the treatment of stress, depression and anxiety in students. A systematic review and meta-analysis. *International journal of environmental research and public health, 16*(22), 4394.
- Hald, G. M., Ciprić, A., Øverup, C. S., Štulhofer, A., Lange, T., Sander, S., ... & Strizzi, J. M. (2020). Randomized controlled trial study of the effects of an online divorce platform on anxiety, depression, and somatization. *Journal of family Psychology, 34*(6), 740.
- Hald, G. M., Ciprić, A., Sander, S., & Strizzi, J. M. (2022). Anxiety, depression and associated factors among recently divorced individuals. *Journal of Mental Health, 31*(4), 462-470.
- Horn, A. B., Samson, A. C., Debrot, A., & Perrez, M. (2019). Positive humor in couples as interpersonal emotion regulation: A dyadic study in everyday life on the mediating role of psychological intimacy. *Journal of Social and Personal Relationships, 36*(8), 2376-2396.
- Khan, T. A., & Hamid, W. (2021). Lived experiences of divorced women in Kashmir: A phenomenological study. *Journal of Gender Studies, 30*(4), 379-394.
- Mahmoudpour, A., Rayesh, N., Ghanbarian, E., & Rezaee, M. (2021). Effectiveness of acceptance and commitment therapy (ACT) on emotional regulation and loneliness of divorced women in Iran. *Journal of Marital and Family Therapy, 47*(4), 831-842.
- Navabinejad, Sh., Rostami, M., & Parsakia, K. (2023). The mediating role of emotional intelligence in the relationship between marital conflicts and tendency to marital infidelity in couples. *Journal of Assessment and Research in Applied Counseling, 5*(1): 1-8.
- Overall, N. C., Clark, M. S., Fletcher, G. J., Peters, B. J., & Chang, V. T. (2020). Does expressing emotions enhance perceptual accuracy of negative emotions during relationship interactions?. *Emotion, 20*(3), 353.
- Saadati, N., Rostami, M., & Darbani, S. A. (2021). Comparing the effectiveness of Acceptance and Commitment Therapy (ACT) and Compassion Focused Therapy (CFT) on improving self-esteem and post-divorce adaptation in women. *Journal of family psychology, 3*(2), 45-58.
- Stockton, D., Kellett, S., Berrios, R., Sirois, F., Wilkinson, N., & Miles, G. (2019). Identifying the underlying mechanisms of change during acceptance and commitment therapy (ACT): A systematic review of contemporary mediation studies. *Behavioural and cognitive psychotherapy, 47*(3), 332-362.
- Surmai, M., & Duff, E. (2022). Cognitive behavioural therapy: a strategy to address pandemic-induced anxiety. *The Journal for Nurse Practitioners, 18*(1), 36-39.
- Tabrizi, F., Ghamari, M., Farahbakhsh, K., & Bazzazian, S. (2019). The effectiveness of integrating acceptance and commitment therapy (ACT) with compassion on worry and rumination of divorced women. *Journal of Psychological Studies, 15*(2), 41-60.

- Watson, D., & Tellegen, A. (1985). Toward a consensual structure of mood. *Psychological bulletin*, 98(2), 219.
- Watson, D., Clark, L. A., & Carey, G. (1988). Positive and negative affectivity and their relation to anxiety and depressive disorders. *Journal of abnormal psychology*, 97(3), 346.
- Wynne, B., McHugh, L., Gao, W., Keegan, D., Byrne, K., Rowan, C., ... & Mulcahy, H. E. (2019). Acceptance and commitment therapy reduces psychological stress in patients with inflammatory bowel diseases. *Gastroenterology*, 156(4), 935-945.